

# Forbidden Configurations: Progress on a Conjecture

Richard Anstee  
UBC, Vancouver

Joint work with Connor Meehan, Miguel Raggi, Attila Sali  
AMS, April 30, 2011  
Las Vegas, Nevada

**Definition** We say that a matrix  $A$  is *simple* if it is a  $(0,1)$ -matrix with no repeated columns.

i.e. if  $A$  is  $m$ -rowed then  $A$  is the incidence matrix of some family  $\mathcal{A}$  of subsets of  $[m] = \{1, 2, \dots, m\}$ .

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\mathcal{A} = \{\emptyset, \{1, 2, 4\}, \{1, 4\}, \{1, 2\}, \{1, 2, 3\}, \{1, 3\}\}$$

**Definition** We define  $\|A\|$  to be the number of columns in  $A$ .

$$\|A\| = 6$$

**Definition** Given a matrix  $F$ , we say that  $A$  has  $F$  as a *configuration* if there is a submatrix of  $A$  which is a row and column permutation of  $F$ .

$$F = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \in A = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & \boxed{1} & \boxed{0} & \boxed{1} & 1 & \boxed{0} \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & \boxed{0} & 0 & \boxed{0} \end{bmatrix}$$

**Definition** Given a matrix  $F$ , we say that  $A$  has  $F$  as a *configuration* if there is a submatrix of  $A$  which is a row and column permutation of  $F$ .

$$F = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \in A = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & \boxed{1} & \boxed{0} & \boxed{1} & 1 & \boxed{0} \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & \boxed{0} & 0 & \boxed{0} \end{bmatrix}$$

We consider the property of forbidding a configuration  $F$  in  $A$ .

**Definition** Let

$$\text{forb}(m, F) = \max\{\|A\| : A \text{ } m\text{-rowed simple, no configuration } F\}$$

Thus if  $A$  is any  $m \times (\text{forb}(m, F) + 1)$  simple matrix then  $A$  contains the configuration  $F$ .

**Definition** Let  $K_k$  denote the  $k \times 2^k$  simple matrix of all possible columns on  $k$  rows.

**Theorem** (Sauer 72, Perles and Shelah 72, Vapnik and Chervonenkis 71)

$$\text{forb}(m, K_k) = \binom{m}{k-1} + \binom{m}{k-2} + \cdots + \binom{m}{0} \text{ which is } \Theta(m^{k-1}).$$

**Definition** Let  $K_k$  denote the  $k \times 2^k$  simple matrix of all possible columns on  $k$  rows.

**Theorem** (Sauer 72, Perles and Shelah 72, Vapnik and Chervonenkis 71)

$$\text{forb}(m, K_k) = \binom{m}{k-1} + \binom{m}{k-2} + \cdots + \binom{m}{0} \text{ which is } \Theta(m^{k-1}).$$

**Corollary** Let  $F$  be a  $k \times \ell$  simple matrix. Then  $\text{forb}(m, F) = O(m^{k-1})$ .

**Definition** Let  $K_k$  denote the  $k \times 2^k$  simple matrix of all possible columns on  $k$  rows.

**Theorem** (Sauer 72, Perles and Shelah 72, Vapnik and Chervonenkis 71)

$$\text{forb}(m, K_k) = \binom{m}{k-1} + \binom{m}{k-2} + \cdots + \binom{m}{0} \text{ which is } \Theta(m^{k-1}).$$

**Corollary** Let  $F$  be a  $k \times \ell$  simple matrix. Then  $\text{forb}(m, F) = O(m^{k-1})$ .

**Theorem** (Füredi 83). Let  $F$  be a  $k \times \ell$  matrix. Then  $\text{forb}(m, F) = O(m^k)$ .

**Definition** A *critical substructure* of a configuration  $F$  is a minimal configuration  $F'$  contained in  $F$  such that

$$\text{forb}(m, F') = \text{forb}(m, F).$$

A critical substructure has an associated construction avoiding it that yields a lower bound on  $\text{forb}(m, F)$ .

Some other argument provides the upper bound for  $\text{forb}(m, F)$ .

A consequence is that for a configuration  $F''$  where  $F'$  is contained in  $F''$  and  $F''$  is contained in  $F$ , we deduce that

$$\text{forb}(m, F') = \text{forb}(m, F'') = \text{forb}(m, F).$$



# Critical Substructures for $K_4$

$$K_4 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Critical substructures are  $\mathbf{1}_4$ ,  $K_4^3$ ,  $K_4^2$ ,  $K_4^1$ ,  $\mathbf{0}_4$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3$ .

Note that  $\text{forb}(m, \mathbf{1}_4) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^3) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^2) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^1)$   
 $= \text{forb}(m, \mathbf{0}_4) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3)$ .

# Critical Substructures for $K_4$

$$K_4 = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{1} & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \mathbf{1} & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \mathbf{1} & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ \mathbf{1} & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Critical substructures are  $\mathbf{1}_4$ ,  $K_4^3$ ,  $K_4^2$ ,  $K_4^1$ ,  $\mathbf{0}_4$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3$ .

Note that  $\text{forb}(m, \mathbf{1}_4) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^3) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^2) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^1)$   
 $= \text{forb}(m, \mathbf{0}_4) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3)$ .

# Critical Substructures for $K_4$

$$K_4 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & \boxed{0} & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & \boxed{0} & \boxed{1} & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & \boxed{1} & \boxed{0} & \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & \boxed{0} & \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Critical substructures are  $\mathbf{1}_4$ ,  $K_4^3$ ,  $K_4^2$ ,  $K_4^1$ ,  $\mathbf{0}_4$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3$ .

Note that  $\text{forb}(m, \mathbf{1}_4) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^3) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^2) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^1)$   
 $= \text{forb}(m, \mathbf{0}_4) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3)$ .

# Critical Substructures for $K_4$

$$K_4 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & \boxed{1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0} & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & \boxed{1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0} & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & \boxed{0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1} & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & \boxed{0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1} & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Critical substructures are  $\mathbf{1}_4$ ,  $K_4^3$ ,  $K_4^2$ ,  $K_4^1$ ,  $\mathbf{0}_4$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3$ .

Note that  $\text{forb}(m, \mathbf{1}_4) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^3) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^2) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^1)$   
 $= \text{forb}(m, \mathbf{0}_4) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3)$ .

# Critical Substructures for $K_4$

$$K_4 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & \boxed{1} & \boxed{0} & \boxed{0} & \boxed{0} & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & \boxed{0} & \boxed{1} & \boxed{0} & \boxed{0} & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & \boxed{0} & \boxed{0} & \boxed{1} & \boxed{0} & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & \boxed{0} & \boxed{0} & \boxed{0} & \boxed{1} & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Critical substructures are  $\mathbf{1}_4$ ,  $K_4^3$ ,  $K_4^2$ ,  $K_4^1$ ,  $\mathbf{0}_4$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3$ .

Note that  $\text{forb}(m, \mathbf{1}_4) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^3) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^2) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^1)$   
 $= \text{forb}(m, \mathbf{0}_4) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3)$ .

# Critical Substructures for $K_4$

$$K_4 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{array}{|c|} \hline 0 \\ \hline 0 \\ \hline 0 \\ \hline 0 \\ \hline \end{array}$$

Critical substructures are  $\mathbf{1}_4$ ,  $K_4^3$ ,  $K_4^2$ ,  $K_4^1$ ,  $\mathbf{0}_4$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3$ .

Note that  $\text{forb}(m, \mathbf{1}_4) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^3) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^2) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^1)$   
 $= \text{forb}(m, \mathbf{0}_4) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3)$ .

# Critical Substructures for $K_4$

$$K_4 = \begin{bmatrix} \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \boxed{1} & \boxed{1} & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Critical substructures are  $\mathbf{1}_4$ ,  $K_4^3$ ,  $K_4^2$ ,  $K_4^1$ ,  $\mathbf{0}_4$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3$ .

Note that  $\text{forb}(m, \mathbf{1}_4) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^3) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^2) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^1)$   
 $= \text{forb}(m, \mathbf{0}_4) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3)$ .

# Critical Substructures for $K_4$

$$K_4 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Critical substructures are  $\mathbf{1}_4$ ,  $K_4^3$ ,  $K_4^2$ ,  $K_4^1$ ,  $\mathbf{0}_4$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3$ ,  $2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3$ .

Note that  $\text{forb}(m, \mathbf{1}_4) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^3) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^2) = \text{forb}(m, K_4^1)$   
 $= \text{forb}(m, \mathbf{0}_4) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_3) = \text{forb}(m, 2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_3)$ .



# Critical Substructures for $K_k$ ?

Critical  $k$ -rowed substructures for  $K_k$  on  $k$  rows are  $K_k^\ell$  for  $0 \leq \ell \leq k$ . On  $k - 1$  rows we conjecture that  $2 \cdot \mathbf{1}_{k-1}$  and  $2 \cdot \mathbf{0}_{k-1}$  are the only critical  $k - 1$ -rowed substructures. Proofs of required base cases elude us although computer investigations suggest we are correct.

We can extend  $K_4$  and yet have the same bound

$$[K_4 | \mathbf{1}_2 \mathbf{0}_2] =$$

$$\left[ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc|c} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{array} \right]$$

**Theorem** (A., Meehan) For  $m \geq 5$ , we have  
 $\text{forb}(m, [K_4 | \mathbf{1}_2 \mathbf{0}_2]) = \text{forb}(m, K_4)$ .

We can extend  $K_4$  and yet have the same bound

$$[K_4 | \mathbf{1}_2 \mathbf{0}_2] =$$

$$\left[ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccc|c} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{array} \right]$$

**Theorem** (A., Meehan) For  $m \geq 5$ , we have

$\text{forb}(m, [K_4 | \mathbf{1}_2 \mathbf{0}_2]) = \text{forb}(m, K_4)$ .

We expect in fact that we could add many copies of the column  $\mathbf{1}_2 \mathbf{0}_2$  and obtain the same bound, albeit for larger values of  $m$ .

# A Product Construction

The building blocks of our product constructions are  $I$ ,  $I^c$  and  $T$ :

$$I_4 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}, \quad I_4^c = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix}, \quad T_4 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

**Theorem** (Balogh, Bollobás 05) Let  $k$  be given. Then  $\text{forb}(m, \{I_k, I_k^c, T_k\})$  is  $O(1)$ .

**Definition** Given two matrices  $A, B$ , we define the product  $A \times B$  as the matrix whose columns are obtained by placing a column of  $A$  on top of a column of  $B$  in all possible ways. (A, Griggs, Sali 97)

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \times \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

Given  $p$  simple matrices  $A_1, A_2, \dots, A_p$ , each of size  $m/p \times m/p$ , the  $p$ -fold product  $A_1 \times A_2 \times \dots \times A_p$  is a simple matrix of size  $m \times (m/p)^p$  i.e.  $\Theta(m^p)$  columns.

**Definition** Given two matrices  $A, B$ , we define the product  $A \times B$  as the matrix whose columns are obtained by placing a column of  $A$  on top of a column of  $B$  in all possible ways. (A, Griggs, Sali 97)

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \times \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

Given  $p$  simple matrices  $A_1, A_2, \dots, A_p$ , each of size  $m/p \times m/p$ , the  $p$ -fold product  $A_1 \times A_2 \times \dots \times A_p$  is a simple matrix of size  $m \times (m/p)^p$  i.e.  $\Theta(m^p)$  columns.

$$[01] \times [01] = K_2$$

$$\overbrace{[01] \times [01] \times \cdots \times [01]}^k = K_k$$

$I_{m/2} \times I_{m/2}$  is vertex-edge incidence matrix of  $K_{m/2, m/2}$

# The Conjecture

We conjecture that our product constructions with the three building blocks  $\{I, I^c, T\}$  determine the asymptotically best constructions.



# The Conjecture

We conjecture that our product constructions with the three building blocks  $\{I, I^c, T\}$  determine the asymptotically best constructions.

**Definition** Let  $F$  be given. Let  $x(F)$  denote the largest  $p$  such that there is a  $p$ -fold product which does not contain  $F$  as a configuration where the  $p$ -fold product is  $A_1 \times A_2 \times \cdots \times A_p$  where each  $A_i \in \{I_{m/p}, I_{m/p}^c, T_{m/p}\}$ .

**Conjecture** (A, Sali 05)  $\text{forb}(m, F)$  is  $\Theta(m^{x(F)})$ .

# The Conjecture

We conjecture that our product constructions with the three building blocks  $\{I, I^c, T\}$  determine the asymptotically best constructions.

**Definition** Let  $F$  be given. Let  $x(F)$  denote the largest  $p$  such that there is a  $p$ -fold product which does not contain  $F$  as a configuration where the  $p$ -fold product is  $A_1 \times A_2 \times \cdots \times A_p$  where each  $A_i \in \{I_{m/p}, I_{m/p}^c, T_{m/p}\}$ .

**Conjecture** (A, Sali 05)  $\text{forb}(m, F)$  is  $\Theta(m^{x(F)})$ .

The conjecture has been verified for  $k \times \ell$   $F$  where  $k = 2$  (A, Griggs, Sali 97) and  $k = 3$  (A, Sali 05) and  $l = 2$  (A, Keevash 06) and for  $k$ -rowed  $F$  with bounds  $\Theta(m^{k-1})$  or  $\Theta(m^k)$  (A, Fleming 10) plus other cases.

In order for a 4-rowed  $F$  to have  $\text{forb}(m, F)$  be quadratic in  $m$ , the associated simple matrix must have a quadratic bound. Using a result of A and Fleming, there are three simple **column-maximal** 4-rowed  $F$  for which  $\text{forb}(m, F)$  is quadratic. Here is one example:

$$F_8 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

How can we repeat columns in  $F_8$  and still have a quadratic bound? We note that repeating either the column of sum 1 or the column of sum 3 will result in a cubic lower bound. Thus we only consider taking multiple copies of the columns of sum 2.

In order for a 4-rowed  $F$  to have  $\text{forb}(m, F)$  be quadratic in  $m$ , the associated simple matrix must have a quadratic bound. Using a result of A and Fleming, there are three simple **column-maximal** 4-rowed  $F$  for which  $\text{forb}(m, F)$  is quadratic. Here is one example:

$$F_8 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

How can we repeat columns in  $F_8$  and still have a quadratic bound? We note that repeating either the column of sum 1 or the column of sum 3 will result in a cubic lower bound. Thus we only consider taking multiple copies of the columns of sum 2. For a fixed  $t$ , let

$$F_8(t) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 & \end{bmatrix} t \cdot$$

$$F_8(t) = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \end{bmatrix} t \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

**Theorem** (A, Raggi, Sali 09) Let  $t$  be given. Then  $\text{forb}(m, F_8(t))$  is  $O(m^2)$ . Moreover  $F_8(t)$  is a **boundary case**, namely for any column  $\alpha$  not already present  $t$  times in  $F_8(t)$ , then  $\text{forb}(m, [F_8(t)|\alpha])$  is  $\Omega(m^3)$ .

The proof of the upper bound is currently a rather complicated induction with some directed graph arguments.

For each  $\alpha$  there are  $\Omega(m^3)$  product constructions avoiding  $[F_8(t)|\alpha]$ .

## $5 \times 6$ Simple Configuration with Quadratic bound

The Conjecture predicts nine 5-rowed simple matrices  $F$  which are **boundary cases**, namely  $\text{forb}(m, F)$  is predicted to be  $O(m^2)$  and for any column  $\alpha$  we have  $\text{forb}(m, [F|\alpha])$  being  $\Omega(m^3)$ . Such  $F$  happen all to be  $5 \times 6$  simple matrices and we have handled the following case.

$$F_7 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

**Theorem** (A, Raggi, Sali)  $\text{forb}(m, F_7)$  is  $O(m^2)$ .

The proof is currently a rather complicated induction.

# All 6-rowed Configurations with Quadratic Bounds

$$G_{6 \times 3} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

**Theorem** (A,Raggi,Sali) Let  $F$  be any 6-rowed configuration. Then  $\text{forb}(m, F)$  is  $O(m^2)$  if and only if  $F$  is a configuration in  $G_{6 \times 3}$ .

**Proof:** We use induction and the bound for  $F_7$ .

# Induction

Let  $A$  be an  $m \times \text{forb}(m, F_7)$  simple matrix with no configuration  $F_7$ . We can select a row  $r$  and reorder rows and columns to obtain

$$A = \text{row } r \begin{bmatrix} 0 & \cdots & 0 & 1 & \cdots & 1 \\ B_r & & C_r & C_r & & D_r \end{bmatrix}.$$

Now  $[B_r C_r D_r]$  is an  $(m-1)$ -rowed simple matrix with no configuration  $F_7$ . Also  $C_r$  is an  $(m-1)$ -rowed simple matrix with no configurations in  $\mathcal{F}$  where  $\mathcal{F}$  is derived from  $F_7$ .

Then

$$\|A\| = \text{forb}(m, F_7) = \|B_r C_r D_r\| + \|C_r\| \leq \text{forb}(m-1, F_7) + \|C_r\|.$$

To show  $\|A\|$  is quadratic it would suffice to show  $\|C_r\|$  is linear for some choice of  $r$ .



# Repeated Induction

Let  $C_r$  be an  $(m - 1)$ -rowed simple matrix with no configuration in  $\mathcal{F}$ . We can select a row  $s$  and reorder rows and columns to obtain

$$C_r = \text{row } s \begin{bmatrix} 0 & \cdots & 0 & 1 & \cdots & 1 \\ E_s & & G_s & G_s & & H_s \end{bmatrix}.$$

To show  $\|C_r\|$  is linear it would suffice to show  $\|G_s\|$  is bounded by a constant for some choice of  $s$ . Our proof shows that assuming  $\|G_s\| \geq 8$  for all choices  $s$  results in a contradiction.

This repeated induction is used to show that  $\text{forb}(m, F_7)$  is  $O(m^2)$ .

# An unusual Bound

**Theorem** (A,Raggi,Sali)  $\text{forb}(m, \{T_2 \times T_2, T_2 \times I_2, I_2 \times I_2\})$  is  $\Theta(m^{3/2})$ .

$$T_2 \times T_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}, \quad T_2 \times I_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix},$$

$$I_2 \times I_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

Let  $A$  be an  $m \times \text{forb}(m, \mathcal{F})$  simple matrix with no configuration in  $\mathcal{F} = \{T_2 \times T_2, T_2 \times I_2, I_2 \times I_2\}$ . We can select a row  $r$  and reorder rows and columns to obtain

$$A = \text{row } r \begin{bmatrix} 0 & \cdots & 0 & 1 & \cdots & 1 \\ B_r & & C_r & C_r & & D_r \end{bmatrix}.$$

To show  $\|A\|$  is  $O(m^{3/2})$  it would suffice to show  $\|C_r\|$  is  $O(m^{1/2})$  for some choice of  $r$ . Our proof shows that assuming  $\|C_r\| > 16m^{1/2}$  for all choices  $r$  results in a contradiction.

THANKS to the session organizers Jozsef and Ryan!